Mobility Management: The Magic of Performance Metrics and Sustainability

Judy L. Shanley, Ph.D.
Asst. VP, Education & Youth Transition

Steven Workman
NCMM, Consultant
Transport New Hampshire

October 2021
Today’s Workshop

• Overview of mobility management and NCMM
• The impetus for coordination – Coordinating Council on Access and Mobility
• A look at performance measures
• What can help make my program(s) last?
  • A tool and your help
• Resource sharing
• Discussion – questions – wrap-up
Mobility Management is about creating community connections

- A well-connected and diverse transportation system is the key to community-wide mobility.

- It begins and ends with the customer, rider, or client.

- We encourage communities’ visions in which the entire transportation network works together.

- Deliver the transportation options that best meet the community’s needs.
Who We Are

A national technical assistance center funded through a cooperative agreement with the Federal Transit Administration and operated through a consortium of three national organizations.

Our Mission

To promote customer-centered mobility strategies that advance good health, economic vitality, self-sufficiency, and community.

We work to promote cross-sector partnerships and help communities create/improve transportation options – “mobility management”
Access NCMM Resources

• Research products and tools
• Our blog, Mobility Lines
• Participate in our events
• Share our online e-Learning modules
• Take advantage of our grant programs
• Encourage your MM colleagues to join MMC
• Connect with your regional liaison
Coordination is the Key!
A Federal Support for Coordination: Coordinating Council on Access and Mobility:
CCAM Mission and Organization

**Mission**
The CCAM issues policy recommendations and implements activities that improve the availability, accessibility, and efficiency of transportation for the following targeted populations:

- Individuals with Disabilities
- Older Adults
- Individuals of Low Income

**History**
The CCAM is an interagency partnership established in 2004 by Executive Order 13330 to coordinate the efforts of the Federal agencies that fund transportation for CCAM targeted populations.

**Organization**

- DOT Secretary
- HHS Secretary
- ED Secretary
- DOL Secretary
- VA Secretary
- USDA Secretary
- HUD Secretary
- DOI Secretary
- Attorney General
- SSA Comm’r
- NCD Chair

---

Coordinating Council on Access and Mobility
CCAM Program Inventory

The CCAM Program Inventory identifies 130 Federal programs that are able to provide funding for human service transportation for people with disabilities, older adults, and/or individuals of low income.

### Number of Programs by Department that May Fund Human Services Transportation

- **HHS**: 66 programs
- **DOT**: 12 programs
- **HUD**: 12 programs
- **DOL**: 11 programs
- **DOJ**: 10 programs
- **ED**: 10 programs
- **DOI**: 4 programs
- **VA**: 3 programs
- **USDA**: 2 programs

Although SSA reported that no programs may fund human services transportation, coordination opportunities were explored. NCD does not fund grant programs.
Federal Fund Braiding Guide

In 2018 and 2019, the CCAM held Federal working sessions to develop the Federal Fund Braiding Guide, a CCAM resource that clarifies acceptable Federal fund braiding for local match opportunities.

**Federal fund braiding for local match** is when Federal funds from one grant program are used to fulfill the local match requirement of another Federal grant.

In order to participate in Federal fund braiding, a project **must meet all requirements** of the participating Federal agencies, including eligibility requirements, reporting requirements, regulatory requirements, statutory requirements, and program guidance.
The CCAM developed a three-page cost-sharing policy statement with a nonemergency medical transportation component to encourage greater State and local cost sharing.

The CCAM Cost-Sharing Policy Statement shares key information on two types of cost-sharing arrangements: vehicle and ride sharing and Federal fund braiding.

**Vehicle and Ride Sharing**
- Describes general principles that apply to any transportation cost-allocation agreement; and
- Details principles specific to Medicaid and the Veterans Health Administration’s Highly Rural Transportation Grants program.

**Federal Fund Braiding**
- Connects grantees to CCAM resources including the CCAM Program Inventory and the Federal Fund Braiding Guide.
A Look at Performance Measurement: Using Data and Metrics to Inform Mobility Management
Question to You....

What are the Challenges Related to Collecting Performance Measurement Data?
Measuring What Matters
The Challenge (and the Magic)

- What to collect
- How to collect (cost effectively)
- How much to collect
- How to use the data to improve and inform
- How to communicate internally and externally
“Here’s a list of 100,000 warehouses full of data. I’d like you to condense them down to one meaningful warehouse.”
# Identify Audience and Understand Their Why

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Riders</th>
<th>I want to have safe and reliable transportation to get to…</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>I want to hire qualified employees who can reliably get to work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care Professionals</td>
<td>I want patients to have good health – and they need to get to appointments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Services</td>
<td>I want the individuals I serve to access inclusive community options</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What’s So Important about Data and Metrics?

- Informs you about performance
- Enable real-time corrections
- Important to “tell your story”
  - Funding, policy, recruitment, partnerships
- Contributes to validity of the service
- Oh yes, sometimes funders require!

National Center for Mobility Management
Collecting the “Right Data”

- Know your challenge/problem
- Know your solution or strategy
- Know the metrics & method
- Know the appropriate analyses
- Know how best to communicate and report
So What Data is Important to Mobility Management?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What we do</td>
<td>Conduct workshops, meetings</td>
<td>Deliver services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deliver products, curriculum, resources</td>
<td>Develop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Train</td>
<td>Provide counseling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Asses</td>
<td>Facilitate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Partner</td>
<td>Work with media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who we reach</td>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>Clients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Agencies</td>
<td>Decision-makers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Decision-makers</td>
<td>Customers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes - Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Short Term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium Term</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Term</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What the short term results are</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitudes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opinions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aspirations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What the medium term results are</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Action</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What the ultimate impact(s) is</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question to You....

Provide Examples of Outputs and Outcomes in your Mobility Management or Coordination Work.
Know your Metrics
Data at Multiple Levels

- Outcomes for riders
- Outcomes for the community and organizations
- Outcomes for transit provider
The Big Question

Make the Business Case....
Rider Level Data & Outcomes

- > Satisfaction Data
- > Service use Data
- > Improved personal conditions
  - opportunity to work
  - improved health
  - independence – less reliance on family – permits family to carry on work – life
  - ability to stay at home – and in community
Community / Organizational Level Data & Outcomes

- > Participation/access to community programs or employment!
- < Underutilized community services (full staffing, no empty seats, etc.)
- < Reduce costs of missed appointments (healthcare, services)
- > Workforce recruitment
Transit Provider Level Data

- > Ridership
- > Innovation and range of mobility services
- < NEMT costs
- > Relationships with health & community providers – unintended positive consequences
  - Cooperative community programs
  - Seek funding opportunities

NCMM
National Center for Mobility Management
It’s All about ROI – What’s In It For Me and My Audiences?

• Measures for employers to invest in transportation
  • ROI calculator This spreadsheet tool allows businesses to calculate the potential reduction in turnover costs by investing in a transportation solution to help employees access the workplace.
  
  https://www.metroplanning.org/multimedia/publication/945

• Measures for direct health care providers to invest in transportation
  • Calculate cost of no-show and missed appointments

• Measures for human services, workforce, and care professionals
  • Client outcomes – increases in jobs, community participation, reduction of crime, increase access to services (Substance abuse & treatment)

• Measures for planners, community and economic development
  • Increase in new business, increase in tax base, businesses that expand and stay in a community, increase in philanthropy by business
KEEPING MOBILITY MANAGEMENT SUSTAINABLE & THRIVING...

LIKE PULLING A RABBIT OUT OF A HAT...
The National Center for Mobility Management
Mobility Management Sustainability Assessment Tool

A self-assessment tool to help mobility management professionals...

- Measure the overall sustainability of their programs.
- Identify the different dimensions of sustainability.
- Focus efforts to increase your sustainability
- A measure of “stick-to-it-iv-ness”!!!

Stick-to-itiveness: Dogged perseverance: TENACITY
https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/stick-to-itiveness
DEVELOPMENT OF THE MM-SAT IS BASED ON

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capability Maturity Framework (CMF)</th>
<th>Mobility Innovation Readiness Assessment Tool (MIRAT)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Federal Highway Administration</td>
<td>• An initiative of AIM-NNet, a partnership between the FTA and the Shared-Use Mobility Center.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The concept of a capability maturity framework emerged from the Strategic Highway Research Program.</td>
<td>• MIRAT’s assessment function is intended to provide a framework for agencies to understand their own organization capabilities and be able to identify areas of improvements, as well as to help transit agencies design a roadmap to improve their organizational readiness for innovation based on their assessment of current conditions, the identification of areas of improvement, and the resources to take actions leading to accelerating innovation provided by the tool.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• CMF was adapted from the software development world, the notion of capability maturity frameworks rest on the following three tenets:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Process matters. Projects fail or do not achieve desired functionality for variety of reasons unrelated to the technology;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Prioritizing the rights actions is important: is an agency ready, how do they know, and what should they do next;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Focus on the weakest link: what is holding the agency back in becoming a leader in a particular area.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Capability Maturity Framework Matrix

The MM-SAT will be adapted from this matrix
How Can the MM-SAT be Used?

• **Identify** the factors or dimensions that contribute to a mobility management network or project to last a long time.

• **Acquire** or design the resources and conditions that help a network develop these characteristics.

• **Integrate** these dimensions into networks and systems.
SMALL GROUP DISCUSSION

Directions

• Form small discussion groups & introduce yourselves.
• Select a scribe & spokesperson.
• Each person should share with the group how s/he defines sustainability or what s/he thinks about when hearing “sustainability”.
• You will have 5-minutes to share.
• Report out to the large group.
• What are the common themes?
Sustainability – noun

1. The ability to be maintained at a certain rate or level.

2. Avoidance of the depletion of natural resources in order to maintain an ecological balance.
Sustainability is not just environmentalism. In addition to natural resources, we also need social and economic resources. Embedded in most definitions of sustainability we also find concerns for social equity and economic development.

Sustainability is a holistic approach that considers ecological, social and economic dimensions, recognizing that all must be considered together to find lasting prosperity.

The definition of sustainability is broad, and the world is a big, diverse places. For sustainability to remain a relevant, useful tool, it is important that it adapt to the local context.

Sustainability is the process of living within the limits of available physical, natural and social resources in ways that allow the living systems in which humans are embedded to thrive in perpetuity.

Source: What is Sustainability?, University of Alberta, Office of Sustainability
WHAT HAS APTA SAID ABOUT SUSTAINABILITY?

- Designing and operating sustainable transit (and community transportation) requires a new way of thinking.

- A transit system can consist of the greenest of earth-friendly, energy-efficient facilities and fleet, but it does little good if it is not used. An empty bus cannot be a sustainable bus.

- If transit doesn't succeed in integrating with and serving the community, it can be an environmental and economic burden and even a scar upon the landscape.

- A holistic practice of transit sustainability leads to a healthier and happier lifestyle and a more livable community.

- While successfully reducing transportation’s environmental footprint, transit agencies around the world have enhanced quality of life by making travel more enjoyable, affordable, and timely.

- For the transit industry to achieve true sustainability, it needs to do everything in the realm of sustainability which is within the control or influence of transit agencies. This requires vision and, occasionally radical, innovation.

Source: Transit Sustainability Guidelines, September 2010, Transit Sustainability Guidelines Working Group, American Public Transportation Association
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Focus of the Dimensions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Organizational Operations</td>
<td>This dimension examines the internal operations of the organization including basic systems, policies and resource management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Communications</td>
<td>This dimension examines how the organization communicates its mission, services, goals and needs internally and externally (users, the public and stakeholders).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Systems &amp; Technology</td>
<td>This dimension examines the systems and technology used to efficiently deliver mobility services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Workforce</td>
<td>This dimension examines the investment the organization makes in attracting and keeping good employees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Culture &amp; Inclusivity</td>
<td>This dimension examines the steps taken to demonstrate cultural sensitivity and inclusivity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Collaboration &amp; Coordination</td>
<td>This dimension examines how the organization collaborates and coordinates with stakeholders, customers and other providers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Multi-modal Integration</td>
<td>This dimension examines how the organization integrates multiple modes of transportation into service delivery.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Performance Measures</td>
<td>This dimension examines the performance measures that you are using to evaluate your operation. This should include internal and external measures, how you organize and think about measures and how you collect and analyze data on each measure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Innovation</td>
<td>This dimension looks at how an organization identifies areas of improvement and its capabilities to make innovative changes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Environmental Impact</td>
<td>This dimension examines the positive and negative impacts operation of your organization has on the environment and the strategies being used to reduce negative impacts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Directions

• Each group will explore two of the identified Dimensions of Sustainability.
• Select a scribe & spokesperson.
• Setup your chart paper.
• Take turns answering the questions below for each of your assigned dimensions.
• You will have approximately 15-minutes to work on both dimensions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension:</th>
<th>Dimension:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supportive</td>
<td>Unsupportive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. What forces support or positively impact this dimension of a thriving, sustainable mobility management program?

2. What forces are unsupportive or negatively impact this dimension of a thriving, sustainable mobility management program?

“Use the Force transportation professionals. Help you it will.” - Jedi Workman
Large Group Final Question

What would make you more likely to use the MM-SAT tool?

Design of matrix?
Make it an electronic tool?
Expand or reduce the number of dimensions?
Change the grading level?
Other....
Why Does All of this Matter?

What Do You Think? What is your Why?
It Matters Because...

- Substantiates continued resource allocation
- Makes our work more credible
- Demonstrates the continued need for coordination, transportation innovation, and partnerships
- Helps you define your network or project
- Creates a foundation for innovation
- Feels good to know your work will be around...
"If you always do what you have always done, you will always get what you always got"

Susan Scott
Fierce Conversations
What to do with Information from this Workshop?

- Have discussions with colleagues across Federal agencies & their grant programs
- Undertake an inventory and collaborate on identifying local opportunities
- Integrate in regional coordination and transportation advisory work - use Federal programs resource as a sort of “checklist” for engagement
- Launch partnerships with projects across Federal sectors
- Develop communication and informational blurbs across agency programs
- Hold informational meetings to enhance awareness across sectors
- Invite representatives of these programs into advisory roles
- Consider the longevity dimensions in relation to your own work
CCAM-FTA Resources

- CCAM Program Inventory

- CCAM Federal Fund Braiding Guide

- CCAM Cost Sharing Policy
The Transportation Technical Assistance Coordination Library (TACL) provides a sustainable methodology and platform to access rural and tribal transportation coordination resources across a diverse range of transportation technical assistance centers and the Federal Transit Administration (FTA).

The FTA-funded technical assistance centers participating in this ongoing work with links to their coordination resources are:

- National Aging and Disability Transportation Center (NADTC)
- National Center for Applied Transit Technology (N-CATT)
- National Center for Mobility Management (NCMM)
- National Rural Transit Assistance Program (National RTAP)
- Shared-Use Mobility Center (SUMC)

http://transportation-tacl.org

Upcoming Twitter Chat:
Let's TACL Coordination
October 20, 2021, 2:00-3:00 PM ET
RSVP to info@nationalrtap.org
Technical Assistance (TA) Centers

**National Center for Mobility Management**
www.nc4mm.org  1-866-846-6400
ingo@nc4mm.org  [Annual Community Grants](#)

**National Aging and Disability Transportation Center**
www.nadtc.org  1-866-983-3222
contact@nadtc.org  [Annual Community Grants](#)

**Rural Transit Assistance Program**
www.nationalrtap.org  1-888-589-6821
info@nationalrtap.org

**Shared-Use Mobility Center**
www.sharedusemobilitycenter.org  1 312.448.8083
info@sharedusemobilitycenter.org

**National Center for Applied Transit Technology**
www.ctaa.org/about-n-catt/
Thank You

Judy Shanley, Ph.D.
Easterseals Director NCMM
Asst. VP for Education and Youth Transition at Easterseals

JShanley@easterseals.com

Steve Workman
NCMM Consultant
steve@transportnh.org